# The Tijuana River Valley: An Ecological Look into the Past



Sam Safran San Francisco Estuary Institute Resilient Landscapes Program

TRNERR Saturday Speaker Series Imperial Beach, CA • October 17, 2015





32

\*\*\*\*

-----

and the second

74

all.

11

MILL

Milling

ng.

and Wille

Mar

HIL.

deres

MIL

TINE

Julie.

E



#### Remarking the boundary, ca. 1894



#### Botanizing on Mesa, 1905

# Image of naturalists in San Diego County removed due to copyright status.

# Image of tourists crossing the Tijuana River removed due to copyright status.

available here: http://content.cdlib.org/ark:/13030/kt5290183w/?docId=kt5290183w&order =1&layout=printable

Unknown ca. 1890, courtesy San Diego History Center



# Archives are a treasure trove of data...

(if you know where to find it) (and how to interpret it)





# Historical Ecology

# Using the past to understand the present landscape and envision its future potential



- Not just the "way things were," but the "way things work"
- Understand system pattern and process at broad temporal and spatial scales
- Not about recreating the past!

## Streams and estuaries reconstructed



### Streams and estuaries reconstructed

(Winchuk)





# Geographic scope

Cottonwood Creek

Mexico



San Diego Bay

Bin M.

Goat Canvon

Smugler's Gulch

United States

46

km

4

Key questions

- What ecological patterns characterized the Tijuana River Valley prior to substantial Euro-American modification?
- What were the physical processes and drivers that shaped the landscape?
- How have ecological mosaics and physical processes changed from the mid-1800s to the present?

courtesy SDNHM

Image of marsh hawk nest removed due to copyright status.

courtesy San Diego History Center

# Image of floods removed due to copyright status.

available here: http://www.sandiegohistory.org/photostore/pro duct/tijuana-river-tourists-crossing-c-1890/

courtesy WRCA

Image of habitat mosaics within river removed due to copyright status.



#### Collect archival data



Extract relevant information



Overlay, synthesize





Create map (and other products)



Align with geophysical data

# Searched > 30 online collections, including:

- Online Archive of California
- Bancroft Digital Collections
- Library of Congress
- Smithsonian Archives of American Art
- Society of California Pioneers
- USC Digital Archive
- MVZ Field Notes Archive
- Claremont Colleges Digital Library
- University of North Texas Digital Library

- Searchable Ornithological Research Archive
- Mapoteca Manuel Orozco y Berra
- Archivo Histórico del Agua
- California Digital Newspaper
  Collection
- Google Books
- David Rumsey Historical Map Collection
- Coast Survey Historical Map & Chart Collection

# Data collection

# Visited 23 local, regional & national archives:

#### <u>Bay Area</u>

- The Bancroft Library
- Hearst Anthropology Museum
- California Historical Society
- Society of California Pioneers
- UC Berkeley Map Library
- Stanford Library & Special Collections

### <u>San Diego</u>

- San Diego Natural History Museum
- SDSU Special Collections
- SDSU Malcolm A. Love Library
- UCSD Mandeville Department of Special Collections
- UCSD Geisel Library
- Scripps Institution of Oceanography Archives
- San Diego History Center
- IBWC Records Office
- Coronado Public Library
- San Diego Public Library

### <u>Los Angeles</u>

- Water Resources Center Archives
- Huntington Library
- CSU Northridge
- National Archives- Riverside
- UCLA Spence/Fairchild Collection
- Seaver Center for Western History

#### <u>Other</u>

National Archives- Arlington



# Visited 9 Mexican archives:

# <u>Tijuana</u>

- Sociedad de Historia de Tijuana
- Instituto de Investigaciones Históricas UABC
- Instituto Municipal de Arte y Cultura
- Biblioteca Alberto Limón Padilla

# <u>Mexico City</u>

- Archivo Histórico del Agua
- Mapoteca Manuel Orozco y Berra
- Archivo General de la Nación
- Fundación ICA
- Instituto de Investigaciones Históricas UNAM





Image removed due to copyright status.



Image removed due to copyright status.

#### Photographs

> 200 landscape photos67 mosaicked aerials

#### Maps

~180 maps45 georeferenced



Dry bid of Streams





S side of slough 75lnks

N side of slough course

to bayou head of which bears SE, general of

1 Seconde 10 ins. a 241 lis. Made trench as p 10 Vicie Course 6 x M. 10 Leave Valley + Con. 10 Set post bor. Secs.

gnathus longimembris pacif erognathus longimembris Iongicaudus Chaetodipus fallax fallax alotis otus nuttal Mal Bucer auratus collaris es auratus collaris Calystegia

Texts

~ 400 textual documents
 246 pages transcribed

## Data compilation



#### annotate, translate, transcribe



georeference, rectify, mosaic



sort, organize, prioritize



# Historical habitat types– Tijuana River Valley, ca. 1850

TIMIT

- Dune
  Beach
  Subtidal water
  Mud flat / Sand flat
  Salt flat / Open water
  Salt marsh

  - Alkali meadow complex / High marsh transition zone
- River channel

River wash / Riparian scrub Grassland / Coastal sage scrub Perennial freshwater wetland Pond Vernal pool Grassland/coastal scrub with wetlands on tablelands and in canyons

# Historical habitat types– Tijuana River Valley, ca. 1850



Salt marsh/mudflatdominated estuary

T

Dune Beach Subtidal water Mud flat / Sand flat Salt flat / Open water Salt marsh

River channel

River wash / Riparian scrub Grassland / Coastal sage scrub Perennial freshwater wetland Pond Vernal pool

Alkali meadow complex / High marsh transition zone

Broad river corridor with (mostly) intermittent flow and riparian scrub



The valley supported a diverse array of wetlands in a dry climate.



Floods maintained a large and dynamic river corridor.



The valley has undergone significant changes in habitat distribution and extent.

Wetland: "...prevalence of vegetation typically adapted for life in saturated soil conditions" (EPA)

non-tidal

tidal

seasonal

perennial

intermittent

- Dune Beach Subtidal water Mud flat / Sand flat Salt flat / Open water Salt marsh Alkali meadow complex / High marsh transition zone
  - 🦉 River channel

River wash / Riparian scrub Grassland / Coastal sage scrub Perennial freshwater wetland Pond Vernal pool

## drylands

#### wetlands

# ~75% wetland habitat types



### Estuarine wetlands

C

### 600 acres of salt marsh (nearly 10% of all vegetated estuarine wetlands in SoCal)

# 200 acres of tidal channels (13 miles in length, reaching 1.5 miles inland)

# 40 acres salt flat

E

N







#### Alkali meadow complex / High marsh transition zone

**1896:** "Salt grass meadows of Tia Juana valley" – Pacific Rural Press 1896

#### Dune

- Beach
- Subtidal water
- Mud flat / Sand flat
- Salt flat / Open water
- Salt marsh

USA

1 km

- Alkali meadow complex / High marsh transition zone
- River channel

River wash / Riparian scrub Grassland / Coastal sage scrub Perennial freshwater wetland Pond Vernal pool



# Map showing "Wells of San Antonio" removed due to copyright status.

available here: http://imgzoom.cdlib.org/Fullscreen.ics?ark=ark:/13030/hb1b69n6jg/ z1&&brand=calisphere

> Poole 1854 Courtesy Bancroft Library



Dune

A REAL PROPERTY OF

- Beach
- Subtidal water
- Mud flat / Sand flat
- Salt flat / Open water
- Salt marsh
- Alkali meadow complex / High marsh transition zone
- River channel

River wash / Riparian scrub Grassland / Coastal sage scrub Perennial freshwater wetland Pond Vernal pool



1 km

N

USA
## Vernal pools and perennial freshwater wetlands

1 km

N

USA

Dune
------

Beach

Subtidal water

Mud flat / Sand flat

Salt flat / Open water

Salt marsh

Alkali meadow complex / High marsh transition zone

River channel

River wash / Riparian scrub Grassland / Coastal sage scrub Perennial freshwater wetland Pond Vernal pool



### Vernal pools



San Diego County 1928

### Vernal pools

W.P. Armstrong 2010, waynesword.com

A.G. Vandergast, USGS

## Map showing modern picture of a vernal pool removed due to copyright status.

available here: http://waynesword.palomar.edu/images2/10verpool2b.jpg

San Diego County 1928

### Vernal pools

"Especially on our mesas were to be found thousands of miniature lagoons [within] innumerable hillocks ..."

"Thus, the lakes were formed, their surface and bottoms grown over with plants till the water was hid from view, and gradually disappeared by evaporation, leaving only **dense jungles on a minute scale**" (Orcutt 1887)



Mendenhall 1905 courtesy of USGS



Dune
Reach

and the second second

Subtidal water

Mud flat / Sand flat

Salt flat / Open water

Salt marsh

USA

N

1 km

Alkali meadow complex / High marsh transition zone

River channel

River wash / Riparian scrub Grassland / Coastal sage scrub Perennial freshwater wetland Pond Vernal pool

## Diseño del Rancho Milijo (map) showing "monte de saus" (willow thicket) removed due to copyright status.

available here: http://imgzoom.cdlib.org/Fullscreen.ics?ark=ark:/13030/hb6489p09n/z2&order=3&brand=calisphere

> USDC ca. 1840 Courtesy Bancroft Library







1 mi 1 km no date, courtesy WRCA Photograph of river bottom showing riparian scrub and river wash removed due to copyright status.





1910, courtesy SDHC

## Photograph showing dense willow scrub removed due to copyright status.

available here: http://www.sandiegohistory.org/prints/border/tijuana-gate-1910-1113





July 1920, courtesy WRCA

Photograph showing river wash and riparian scrub in Matanuco Canyon removed due to copyright status.



#### Aerial photograph of Tijuana River broad patterns of river wash and riparian scrub (and lack of trees) removed due to copyright status.

A similar photograph available here: http://www.sandiegohistory.org/photostore/product/tijuana-river-tourists-crossing-c-1890/

### Primarily willow scrub, but broad range of species

Common Name	Latin Name
Trees	
sandbar willow	Salix exigua
Goodding's willow	S. gooddingii
red willow	S. laevigata
arroyo willow	S. lasiolepis
cottonwood	Populus sp.
California sycamore	Platanus racemosa
Shrubs	
mulefat	Baccharis salicifolia
black sage	Salvia mellifera
white sage	S. apiana
common sagebrush	Artemisia tridentata
arrowweed	Pluchea sericea
Bush senecio	Senecio douglasii
fourwing saltbush	Atriplex canescens
chaparral mallow	Malacothamnus fasciculatus
northwest willow	Salix sessilifolia
California fagonia	Fagonia laevis
blue elderberry	Sambucus nigra subsp. caerulea



Species indicative of

wetter ZONES (obligate and facultative wetland species)



Species indicative of **drier** zones (sage scrub species, generally more xeric)

Herbs	
nightshade	Solanum sp.
clematis	Clematis ligusticifolia
branching phacelia	Phacelia ramosissima
Chinese parsley	Heliotropium curassavicum
rigid bird's beak	Cordylanthus rigidus
bladderpod	Peritoma arborea
skunkbush	Navarretia squarrosa
Matilija poppy	Romneya coulteri
California evening primrose	Oenothera californica
spiny rush	Juncus acutus
southwestern spiny rush	Juncus acutus subsp. leopoldi
California croton	Croton californicus
Heermann's lotus	Acmispon heermannii
Nuttall's lotus	Lotus nuttallianus
Beardless wild rye	Elymus triticoides
spiny goldenbush/ spiny chloracantha	Chloracantha spinosa, C. spinosa var. spinosa
bush seepweed	Suaeda nigra
slender woolly-heads	Nemacaulis denudata var. gracilis
scarlet lupine	Lupinus concinnus
California sealavender	Limonium californicum
Indian hemp	Apocynum cannabinum
mugwort	Artemisia douglasiana
wide throated yellow monkeyflower	Mimulus brevipes
volcanic gilia	Gilia ochroleuca ssp. Exilis
ropevine clematis	Clematis pauciflora

#### Records from 1849-1949

Sept 1889: "spring" Sept 1869: "dry bed of TJ river"

Summer 1931: "Potholes" with water

Sept. 1869: "running water" June 1854: "in dry time sink in sand"

1849: above this point... "dry during the greatest portion of the year"

May 1769: "stream running with a good sized flow of water that... issues up out of the ground" [location very approximate] September 1869: "bed of river dry"

September 1869: "bed of river dry" Dry-season conditions:
areas without surface water
areas with surface water

1 mi

km

September 1869: "dry bed of ravine"

- July 1903: "waterless Tia Juana River" May 1928: surface flow disappears

July 1937: "river near the boundary ceased flowing"

Agua Caliente hot springs "agua permanente"

Jan 1910: river "water for some months to come" in Matanuco Cnyn.

July 1920: surface flow in photos.

Intermittent river; limited locations with perennial surface water

# Photograph of hot springs in Tijuana River removed due to copyright status.

# Photograph of "cienega" wetlands associated with hot springs in Tijuana River removed due to copyright status.

Perennial wetlands within the river corridor

# Photograph of "cienega" wetlands associated with hot springs in Tijuana River removed due to copyright status.

### Perennial wetlands within the river corridor



Modern day comparison photograph of hot springs site.



The valley supported a diverse array of wetlands in a dry climate.





The valley has undergone significant changes in habitat distribution and extent.





Floods maintained a large and dynamic river corridor.



The valley has undergone significant changes in habitat distribution and extent.

### Periodic floods inundated most of the valley

courtesy San Diego History Center

#### Image of Tijuana River during dry season removed due to copyright status.

available here: http://www.sandiegohistory.org/photostore/product/au to-crossing-mexico-border-c-1921-6661-4// courtesy San Diego History Center

#### Image of Tijuana River during flood removed due to copyright status.

similar photo available here: http://www.sandiegohistory.org/prints/bajacalifornia/tijuana-flood-1916-20295



"The Tia juana river, on the road hence to Yuma, is two miles wide" (Arizona Sentinel 2/21/1874)

2 miles

PH1

和

"The Tia juana river, on the road hence to Yuma, is two miles wide" (Arizona Sentinel 2/21/1874)

> "It just flooded more or less the whole valley." (Bruhlmeier 1937)

"overflow area" (Cruse 1937)

"The Tia juana river, on the road hence to Yuma, is two miles wide" (Arizona Sentinel 2/21/1874)

> "It just flooded more or less the whole valley." (Bruhlmeier 1937)

Tijuana River overflow into San Diego Bay 1891, 1916, 1927 (also possibly 1825 and 1862)

"overflow area" (Cruse 1937)

Picture taken a few days after the flood of Jan. 27, 1916.

Morris 1916 from USACE 1937

### Method 1: Ford

#### Image of tourists crossing the flooded Tijuana River in horse drawn carriages removed due to copyright status.

available here: http://www.sandiegohistory.org/photostore/product/tijuana-river-tourists-crossing-c-1890/

courtesy San Diego History Center

Border crossings during a flood...

Method 2: Zip

Image of individual crossing the flooded Tijuana River using a cable strung across the stream removed due to copyright status.

courtesy Sociedad de Historia de Tijuana

### Floods drove river movement



## Aerial image of Tijuana River showing multiple channel courses removed due to copyright status.

May 1941 (after sizeable floods in February, March, and April)

Erickson 1941, courtesy San Diego History Center











Floods created habitat variability

# Aerial image of Tijuana River showing different densities of riparian vegetation removed due to copyright status.

### "spatial variability"

Erickson 1941, courtesy San Diego History Center

### Floods created habitat variability



"temporal variability"

Floods created habitat variability

• Photo likely taken after either flood of 1891 or 1895; vegetation scoured in foreground.

# Image of tourists crossing the Tijuana River at the border removed due to copyright status.

available here: http://content.cdlib.org/ark:/13030/kt5290183w/?docId=kt5290183w&order=1&layout=printable

### "temporal variability"

ca. 1890, courtesy SDHC
Floods created habitat variability

- Photo likely taken after either flood of 1891 or 1895; vegetation scoured in foreground.
- Re-vegetation between ca. 1895 and 1910

#### Later image taken at the same location removed due to copyright status.

available here: http://www.sandiegohistory.org/prints/border/tijuana-gate-1910-1113



ca. 1900, courtesy SDHC

Floods created habitat variability

- Photo likely taken after either flood of 1891 or 1895; vegetation scoured in foreground.
- Re-vegetation between ca. 1895 and 1910
- Floods in 1916 and 1918

#### Photos of floods at the border removed due to copyright status.

Images available here:

http://www.oac.cdlib.org/ark:/13030/kt7w1020j2/?docId=kt7w1020j2&order=1&layout=printable

## "temporal variability"

ca. 1890, courtesy SDHC

### Floods created habitat variability

- Photo likely taken after either flood of 1891 or 1895; vegetation scoured in foreground.
- Re-vegetation between ca. 1895 and 1910
- Floods in 1916 and 1918
- Vegetation scoured again



## "temporal variability"





Floods maintained a large and dynamic river corridor.



The valley has undergone significant changes in habitat distribution and extent.







The valley has undergone significant changes in habitat distribution and extent.

#### Tijuana River Valley habitat types – ca. 1850

H

Dune Beach Subtidal water Mud flat / Sand flat

km

Salt flat / Open water

Salt marsh

Alkali meadow complex / High marsh transition zone

River wash / Riparian scrub Grassland / Coastal sage scrub Perennial freshwater wetland Pond Vernal pool

> basemap: NAIP 2014

River channel

#### Tijuana River Valley habitat types – ca. 2012





River wash / Riparian scrub Grassland / Coastal sage scrub Perennial freshwater wetland Riparian forest Agriculture Developed / Disturbed

basemap: NAIP 2014

## <u>Findings</u>

- Estuarine habitats situated higher in the tidal frame
- Development of low mesa and 100% loss of associated wetlands
- Complete loss of valley floor alkali meadows; now supports grassland/CSS
- In US, river corridor compressed & wetter (riparian scrub → riparian forest)



## <u>Findings – River Valley</u> (Mexico)

- River wash / Riparian scrub almost entirely developed
- River channel with multiple braids replaced with straightened Concrete channel
- Small patches of **Riparian scrub** now disconnected from river channel
- Historical river corridor 200-1,400 m wide; now uniformly 100 m wide





supported a diversity of wetland types in a semi-arid region.



featured a dynamic river corridor – but with some stable aspects.



experienced major changes in habitat distribution and extent.

#### Management implications

# **Riparian forest** is a "new" (but critical) habitat type Long-term compatibility with intermittent flows?

#### Groundwater levels have rebounded

Can "missing" historical wetland types be supported?



#### Management implications



Recent **channel movement** events have historical precedence Implications for how to treat "new" channels? Some parting thoughts...

• International boundary is arbitrary from the perspective of historical ecology.

• Shared ecological history is a unifying force.

• Anything we missed?

## THANK YOU.

## sams@sfei.org www.sfei.org/programs/resilient-landscapes





Funder California State Coastal Conservancy

#### Team

Sean Baumgarten (*SFEI*) Erin Beller (*SFEI*) Robin Grossinger (*SFEI*) Sam Safran (*SFEI*) Shawna Dark (*CSU Northridge*) Danielle Bram (*CSU Northridge*) Travis Longcore (*USC*) Eric Stein (*SCCWRP*) Jeff Crooks (*TRNERR*) Julio Lorda (*TRNERR*)

#### Technical Advisors

Brian Bledsoe (*Colorado State*) Jeff Haltiner (*ESA*) Dave Jacobs (*UCLA*) John Largier (*UC Davis*) Lina Ojeda (*COLEF*) Bruce Orr (*Stillwater Sciences*) Ellen Wohl (*Colorado State*) Richard Wright (*San Diego State*) Joy Zedler (*UW-Madison*)